DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 310 087 SP 031 381

AUTHOR Mead, J. V.

TITLE Looking at Old Photographs: Investigating the Recollections That Novices and Teachers Bring with Them.

INSTITUTION National Center for Research on Teacher Education, East Lansing, MI.

SPONS AGENCY Office of Educational Research and Improvement (ED), Washington, DC.

PUB DATE 89

GRANT OERI-G-86-0001

NOTE 41p.

PUB TYPE Reports - Research/Technical (143)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.

DESCRIPTORS Career Choice; Elementary Secondary Education; *Identification (Psychology); Interpersonal Relationship; *Modeling (Psychology); *Personal Narratives; Preservice Teacher Education; *Role Models; Teacher Attitudes; Teacher Behavior; *Teacher Student Relationship

ABSTRACT

This paper analyzes interviews with preservice, novice, and inservice teachers on their recollections of elementary or secondary teachers from their student days who served as either positive or negative role models. The interviewees described events in which they were student participant observers, providing a perspective which captures ideas, behaviors, and contexts of particular teaching acts. The paper looks at the nature of these projections as informants report them in the form of recall of their school experiences. The relationship between these recollections of former teachers and the constructs of teaching the informants appeared to hold are examined. In the analyses of the unconscious mentors, the model teachers are described and a summary is given of the qualities they demonstrated. The first part of the paper reports the detailed findings on the positive and negative models cited, focusing on the reasons given by the informants for choosing them. Comments are made on the qualities of the model the informants chose to report and some sequences and patterns that appear from the reports. The last section briefly describes the role of self-conceptions of teaching, dealing with why the informants wished to enter teaching. (JD)

**********
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
**********

ED310087

# Looking at Old Photographs: Investigating the recollections that Novices and Teachers bring with them.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

J.V. Mead

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

J.V. Mead.[1]
Michigan State University.

This research was supported in part by the National Center for Research on Teacher Education, Michigan State University. The NCRTE is funded primarily by the Office of Educational Research and Improvement, United States Department of Education. The opinions expressed herein are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the position, policy, or endorsement of the OERI/ED. (grant No. OERI-G-86-0001).

---

[1]The author expresses appreciation to the following people for their helpful comments and assistance in preparing this paper: C. Clark, J. Cormier, R. Floden, M.M. Kennedy and M.Parker. I dedicate the paper to the memory of my Great-Grandmother who provided the activity that inspired this reflection.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE



SP031381

## Looking at Old Photographs.

When I was ten years old I visited my Great-Grandmother. A large cigar box contained my favorite activity. In the box were early sepia photographs taken in the late eighteen hundreds. There was a stereographic magnifier on which double pictures could be placed that I found absorbing for a short time. Most of these daguerreotypes were portraits of people in my family and their friends.

My absorption with the task was short because I did not recognize the people portrayed in the photos. The activity came alive when my Great-Grandmother would sit and describe the people I saw. My relatives' recollections while good were undoubtedly edited, embellished, and distorted with the intervening sixty or seventy years. Nevertheless, these conversations represented a glimpse of her reality in an age and context far beyond my experience as a ten year old boy.

The study I am about to describe has many of the elements of viewing sepia photographs. The informants in this paper describe significant teachers they had. Their past recall and recollection will not represent truth. What they and my Great-Grandmother gave is a constructed reality transformed by the passage of time. The interviewees describe events where they were student participant observers. The descriptions represent what Adler (1984) calls

"teacher perspective," a perspective that captures ideas, behaviors, and contexts of particular teaching acts. They are individual reports of their "apprenticeship of observation" as Lortie put it.

It is an open question whether the events depicted "happened." While there is little doubt something of significance to the informant occurred, the description represents a reconstruction of what happened. In the recall process the listener hears an interpretation based on the event and later reflection on it. The data in this paper suggest that the stories told represent a projection of ideals from the informant onto the chosen model. The model served as a passive receptor of this ideal projection. A negative model seems negative because it did not conform to this projection.

This paper looks at the nature of these projections as informants report them in the form of recall of their school experiences. The questions I address report who and what they cite. In this counting and sorting exercise some interesting variation emerges between different types of respondent. I then explore the relationship between these recollections of former teachers and the constructs of teaching the informant appears to hold. The analysis reveals the recollections form a "flesh" around the skeletal network of the construct. The relationship to the constructs is multi-faceted. It is not a simple relationship where a particular

series of recollections automatically integrate into a particular image of good teaching held by an individual.

The teacher remembrances analyzed draw from 108 baseline interviews conducted by the National Center for Research on Teacher Education. Informants come from five pre-service training institutions, two induction programs, and two teacher in-service programs. The pre-service students intend to teach various K-12 age groups; a small number do not intend to teach when they graduate. The students are either working toward bachelors' or masters' degrees in their chosen field. The two induction programs contain demographically diverse populations. One site is an established mentor program sponsored jointly by the local university and school district. The university awards a Masters' Degree on successful completion. The second induction program is an alternative training route run by a local school district. This program has mentor teachers assigned to the novices like the first program described. Successful completion leads to a state teaching credential. The two inservice programs draw experienced teachers and focus on the teaching areas of mathematics and writing. The sample can be crudely characterized as containing students and teachers from all age brackets and a variety of backgrounds.

What is the value of looking at old photographs? Here the memories of significant teachers from informant own school experience. The study by Sikes (1985) reports the importance of remembering one's

own school experience in the development of a personal pedagogy. Feiman-Nemser and Buchmann (1985) rightly warn of the pitfalls of experience, especially familiarity, as a source of learning experiences to prepare teachers. Revisiting the past has positive and negative implications for novice and educator. I offer a systematic analysis of the model constructed by novices and practitioners based on their remembrance. Zeichner, Tachnick, and Densmore (1987) review the literature on pre-training experience. They point out that beyond three theories of socialization in pre-service experience there is little empirical evidence to clarify the sources of influence. I examined two sources of influence, teachers they experienced and self-conceptions that motivated them to teach. The second element is included because these ideas closely relate to significant models cited by the informants. The informant, not the model, is the source of the ideal construct in both cases. In this paper I will not reiterate in the self-portrait section the findings extensively reported by Lortie (1975) on teacher self-image and rewards.

The stories the informants tell are similar to Dundes (1972) "folk ideas." The informant invests these models with emotional and factual value. They serve as remembrances to which the reality of teaching can be matched. Wittgenstein describes a belief structure in which various facts about the world are embedded. The stories represent some of the covering tissue on which the informants'

worldview of teaching rests. Informants use stories as illustrations for their personal belief structure.

What role should these teacher stories have in the mentor--mentee[2] interaction? The evidence presented argues that the mentor--mentee negotiate. The basis of good negotiation is the recognition of both parties interests and expectancies (Bandura, 1977; Mischel, 1979; Fisher & Ury, 1981; Mead, 1988). The emerging contract allows the parties to appreciate the central interests of both sides.[3] The educational task that prompts the negotiation is for the mentor to act as a guide. It is a foolhardy guide who arbitrarily chooses where to start a journey and then marches off

---

[2] I use the word mentor in a generic sense. It refers to a context in which a novice seeks out enlightenment on their practice from another. Many teacher educators in training institutions see this as a part of their role in the supervisory process of teaching. It also includes those colleagues the novice may encounter at school how serve as involuntary or assigned mentors along a continuum. Where the colleague falls on the continuum depends upon the specific institutional arrangements in that setting.

[3]The process of contracting as defined is a positive process not to be confused with the "implicit contracts" struck between people. Contract here is positive leading to desired learning outcomes. Contract has also been used in a negative sense to describe the mechanism by which the real issues and tasks are avoided. (see Cusick, P.A. (1983) The Egalitarian Ideal and the American High School. Powell, A.G. et al (1985) The Shopping Mall High School. Sizer, T. (1984) Horace's Compromise. for negative contracting.) Contract is also not to be viewed in the sense of Rawls, J. (1971) Theory of Justice. where the negotiating parties do so behind a veil of ignorance as to their future place in the settlement. Positive contracts here are akin to Scanlon, H. (1973) Contractualism and utilitarianism, where both parties enter negotiation with knowledge of outcome and bring unique experience with them.

to a destination they determined. It is better to locate where the client is and meet them there.

Kennedy (1989) discusses two models of good teaching. In the "Reflective Practitioner Model" the frames of reference applied are influenced by prior experience. This establishes some link to the informants' recollections explored here. The model assumes an evolving knowledge base. Part of the mentor role reconstructs the mentees experience and transforms a model biased from the client\student perspective to the seller\teacher perspective. This role suggests the mentor understands models the protegee holds that represent moderating contextual features for that protegee (Clark & Peterson, 1986).

The second "Professional Standards Model" of good teaching assumes best practice from generally accepted standards. The model denies any causal effect of mentee recollection. However, the teacher education literature heavily emphasizes the danger of assuming a "tabula rosa" stance and reports rapid decay in teacher education program effects. Those mentors subscribing to this model will find evidence that ignoring student recollections may contribute to their poor educational effect.

Like Kennedy I see both models as imperfect representations of good teaching. Neither forms a persuasive account on which to base professional preparation. Mentee recollection affects both models.

The reflective model potentially recognizes informant recollection playing a part in reflection. The professional standards model, ignores informant recollection and therefore fails to have a lasting affect.

The reconstruction role is an active one for the mentor. However, work by Schein (1985) suggests two elements to a mentor role in changing cultural assumptions. Reconstruction is the active role but equally important is the provision of psychological support. Short of setting up a clinical counselling session, what does this mean for the mentor? I suggest that this support, a passive role, comes from being a reflector of the mentee's ideals. This passive role allows the active reconstruction process to occur. Schein notes the lack of cognitive change in the adult world without offering support.

The story of Plato's cave dwellers has a lesson for would be master--novice relations. The mentor (the prisoner released from his chains) represents the lucky person who bathed in the pure light of truth. Rarely do craftmasters remember in detail their own feelings of dissonance when their early cognitions dissolved. The fate of the mentor who returned to spread the news of reality as he understood it was hemlock. In teacher education generally the result is lack of novice acceptance of "good practice."

Zimpher and Rieger (1988) describe the many roles, functions, and conditions under which mentoring takes place. While like them I endorse the Schon (1983) notion of collective reflection on practice by professionals, prior experience is an important part of the novice's experience. The models the teachers describe are not perfect. Certain aspects chosen by the informants suggest that the informant is an active participant in the selection process. This evidence supports the contention that the mentoring relationship is a dialectic, composite construction, such as reported by Becker, Geer, Hughes, and Strauss (1961)[4] in other fields. The mentor, while having knowledge of the mentee's teacher perspective, is free to confront those constructs with a view to dismantling or transforming them (Dinham and Stritter, 1986). Research in other fields show positive results in such strategies. The learning strategy assumes a series of imperfect models honed sharper by newly integrated experience with the assistance of the educator.

What follows is an analysis of unconscious mentors who contributed to the informants' folk ideas. I summarize the model teachers they described, then, present qualities they stress together with patterns suggested by the data.

---

[4]cited in Dinham & Stritter see references for full citation. The Becker et al. classic study of medical students is just one field in which such strategies are employed.

Counting and Sorting the Photographs.

A total of 109 interviews analyzed, yielded 163 explicit teaching models from the informants' elementary and high school experience (see Figure 1). I speculated whether prospective English teachers, for example, have positive English teacher models drawn from their own background. If all or the majority identified a positive model then some claim of direct causality could be made. A direct causal claim for the power of matched models is not supported by the analysis. Prospective high school English teachers described specific models from a range of subjects spread throughout the high school. It would be dangerous to assume that a prospective teacher (in a specific subject or age range) chooses to teach in that area based on a particular model.

In the pre-service sites there was a tendency for prospective high school math teachers to identify positive math models. The same trend appears in the prospective elementary teachers to cite positive and negative elementary models. However, the interviews also showed the informant found school a personally rewarding experience. Prospective math teachers explained they always felt confident in mathematics classes without attributing this to a particular teacher. Either perceived personal success in class or a positive model could affect career choice in high school math and elementary teachers.

The high school English group showed a small but marked tendency to be more critical of high school teachers. The elementary teachers were also critical. Both these critical groups described in great detail the negative models. Very few non-teachers are in the sample grid but the math majors at one site mirrored the prospective secondary teachers in their choice distribution.

Not included in Figure 1 were a few teacher perspectives found in other settings. There were 5 (out of 109 informants) references to specific models in the junior high or middle school setting. I find it interesting that so few people see the transition years form elementary to high school as a career option or source of models. Of these references the three positive models cited were by informants from Site 2. Two reported they preferred to teach in middle school settings. One stated this teacher influenced her so she decided to enter teaching and model her practice on him. The two negative models came from the same informant in Site 3. This informant reported she did not intend to teach. Two informants cite positive models from junior college, again one from each of the sites 2 & 3. Both these informants intend to teach outside the junior college setting.

The analysis looked for gender matches, for example, if females picked female models but found no pattern based on gender. I also used age as a variable but could find no discernable differences or pattern between younger and older informants. The obvious

relationship between family and friends who provided teaching models were present. I offer these conclusions tentatively recognizing the small numbers within each group.

Figure 1 represents a systematic catalog, generating questions for future study. A sample of more prospective subject area specialists may confirm a trend toward reporting more positive models within their chosen specialism. Feiman-Nemser & Floden, (1986) report the need to recognize the range of diversity in the cultures of teaching. The data presented support sensitivity to diversity in two ways. Different groups and individuals describe diversity in the models the cite. The informants themselves represent diverse attitudes and ideals they bring to teaching.

Great-Grandmother's Story for the Photographs.

This section reports the detailed findings on the positive and negative models cited. The focus is the reasons given by the informants for choosing the model. I comment on the parts of the model the informants chose to report and some sequences and patterns that appear. Throughout the more quantitative analysis attempted above and cataloged in figure 1 other questions arose. Examining individual responses not categories and quantities best answer the qualitative questions.

The interview protocol asked the informant to give the reasons why they wanted to teach. Most informants gave replies based on a

particular image they have of teaching. The analysis of these replies takes place in the self-portrait section. Only 5 (out of 109) prospective or practicing teachers attributed their decision to teach to the influence of a single positive role model. Even within this small minority there was variation. Two reached their decision based on the advice of a respected high school teacher. Both these advising models taught in areas not chosen by the informant. Only three, one practitioner and two prospective elementary teachers, reported the desire to emulate the behavior and beliefs of their positive model. The following reply represents such a response.

> "Oh when I was in second grade I had a fabulous teacher and I wanted to be just like her."
>
> (Fiona, induction site teacher, elementary)

A lack of specificity in attribution points to some interesting speculations. Ross (1988) reported selectivity in choosing both good and bad models. The informants display a tendency to choose specific attributes and parts of behavior. The resulting model represents the composite one reviewed by Dinham & Stritter from other professional training. Most informants rejected viewing knowledge given from one source as more certain and directly relevant to action. This supports the philosophic analysis by Buchmann (1985) who questioned the idea of utility directly drawn from knowledge. The composites constructed upon reflection of experience show an uncoupling of knowledge from use.

The interview protocol asked the informant to describe significant features of their school experience. All age ranges up to college learning experiences were covered. Questions varied depending on the informant's area of study (ie., Math majors and prospective secondary Mathematics teachers had the questions framed in their subject area). Whatever the protocol variation, the most frequent response was the teachers.

I: "What do you remember about elementary school?"

R: "One of the biggest things is [sic] the teachers themselves..... One teacher really stands out in my K through 5 experience, and that was my fourth grade teacher."

(Jerome, pre-service elementary teacher)

I: "What do you remember about English in high school?"

R: ".....Wow! I know there were teachers I liked. I remember Mr. ---(name supplied) that was my sophomore year English teacher, he was a really nice guy."

(Mabel, pre-service high school English teacher)

R: " In high school I had some really good English teachers. I don't remember the specifics ....."

(Emily, elementary teacher writing in-service program)

Comments ranged over the teacher's pedagogical skills or lack of them, various model personality traits, and the informant's emotional response to the behavior and beliefs of the cited model. It required considerable probing to get the informant to recall

specific details of knowledge learnt or even to mention subject matter. Very often the recall after probing resulted in vague labelling of knowledge or specific detail of one isolated activity or experience. In contrast the descriptions of the teachers are rich in detail and wide-ranging. Many informants traced their elementary or secondary teachers in great detail. This deep contrast shows the importance of affective reaction in informant recollections. The learner remembers vividly the transmitter of the knowledge while retaining vague details of the precise content transmitted.

The informants do not report they intend to act on this experience in their own practices. Feiman-Nemser & Buchmann with British analytic philosophy of the Sixties remind of the fallacy of assumptions made in many discovery learning situations. The fallacy points to an important role for the mentor making important learning connections. Mentees need explicit uncovering of their own ideas about teachers and teaching to integrate them in their practice. Deep reflection conducive to learning suggests identification of affect remembered and a linking to content knowledge personally integrated and therefore not attributed to the teacher model.

Buchmann (1987a) distinguishes between role and personal affect. Most respondents emphasize personal affect (reaction to a role observed). If it is to have relevance in a role as a teacher, the

mentor needs to challenge the mentees' subjective reasoning. The mentor can be a supportive challenger to the subjective reasoning of the mentee teacher. As Little (1981) noted, the teacher role is a public one not a reflection of personal and individual preference. Buchmann and the data show that not all constructions of reality or all points of view have equal merit. Views formed as a student may not be sound or supportive of good practice. Mentors expose their mentees' points of view for public scrutiny and reflection.

Feiman-Nemser and Buchmann imply that a role of the mentor is to re-focus a mentee pre-occupation with process (the mechanics of teaching) toward the desired product -- student learning. The data shows the same pre-occupation with the pedagogical process.

> R: "Well, I did well through the algebra and geometry and when we started getting trigonometry I faltered a little there. I'm not sure what it was. I remember the teachers who were very helpful and got it across to me."
>
> (Jack, preservice elementary teacher)

Positive and negative models of teaching strongly lean toward the ability of the model to communicate with the informant. This communication (pedagogic skill or the lack of it) appears in the negative and positive models cited.

> R: "Well, they always seemed very helpful and they had nice personalities, at least from my point of view as a child."
>
> (Lee, pre-service elementary teacher)

R: "One teacher in particular Mrs. ---[name supplied] who I see from time to time now, she was real concerned about it [it refers to making sure the student had got the point the teacher wished to get across earlier in text] and I was a new student there and she just was real concerned about me learning. How do you know that? What did you do? .....I remember her helping me with a spelling test. I think she helped me with a spelling test as far as learning how to <u>study</u> [emphasis added] my vocabulary. Well, she worked with me after school on that."

(Louise, pre-service elementary teacher)

The data provides evidence that former students perceive pedagogy or process as important. The informants attributed learning to themselves internally and not directly to the model teacher. Mentors could build on these experiences to produce justification of instructional decisions (process problems) and reflecting on the consequences of particular teaching actions. In the mentor's favor is what Buchmann (1987b) analyzes as a loose connection between premises and intended action. Mentors serve a linking function between existing process data and desired good in teaching (student learning). This linking involves progressive reconstruction and not an improving of the premise that already exists in the mentees' mind. The premise here derives from past experience biased from the perspective of a student receiving instruction. The mentor should be aware that the expert's construction of knowledge may not be an obvious or natural structure for the novice (Glaser 1984).

Lortie coined the term "apprenticeship of observation." The use of the word apprentice conjures images of learning. It is a small but significant and fallacious step to attribute positive learning to such an "apprenticeship".

As well as process there is the leaning toward personalizing the experience with the model. The informants report feelings of intimate and individual attention by the model toward themselves.

> R: "I think the most positive influences have been the teachers. I can remember in, in, in second grade, where we had to write a poem about love, and you know, I handed it in and I forgot totally about it. And a few years ago I saw my second grade teacher, and she said Caroline come here. And I go over to her and she pulls out her wallet, and out of her wallet she pulls this piece of paper and my, my poem is written on it. And I, mean, it is just really positive experiences like that have made me decide if I could, if I could influence people like that I would feel fulfilled."
>
> (Caroline, high school English teacher induction program)

Informants significantly cited a lack of intimacy and distance in negative role models.

> R: "The second grade teacher was not like that. Um, a lot of times I ended up taking my homework home because I didn't understand it in class. It was the same class with the reading, I just sat there like--What am I supposed to do?"
>
> (Jane, pre-service elementary teacher)

R: "He made it difficult for me when I asked a question. He made me, he belittled me when I asked questions and after that I was afraid to ask anything."

(Carmen, high school English teacher induction program. Carmen is describing a high school Math teacher who she attributes her failure in Mathematics to.)

Positive models created the perception of interest in the informant and specific concern for their welfare, learning and development. The data captures Yamamoto's (1988) notion of restructuring as an appropriate role for a mentor. Yamamoto did not specify the details of the restructuring in content terms. The data potentially forms a basis of that content. Like Hardcastle (1988), the informants supplied a vision of their model couched in terms of their commitment, integrity, high expectations of the model for the informants progress and work. Questions of process, judgments of positive and negative behaviors, successful dispositions are part of the content the novice can reflect upon.

The other side of the coin, the negative models, give good evidence that the respondent not the model is the source of the story. An overriding emotion in the exchange is one of embarrassment. See Carmen above for such a quote. Informants cited the model's tendency toward lacking integrity in their interaction with students. Negative high school models in particular were perceived as insensitive to the informants' fragile role as a learner. The incidents recounted show negative feelings flowing out from a

personal sense of hurt or anger in the informant, and then externalize toward the model. Projection theory suggests the model failed to reflect the image the informant expected. As this occurred, the informant felt lost and distanced from the teacher. Distance led to feelings of dislike for the negative model through the feelings of the informant. This dislike translates to a failure on the model's part. Through the whole process, the informant --not the model-- makes the major contribution in the process. The model supplies confirmation in either a positive or negative fashion.

Distance and closeness are important themes in the informants' descriptions of the models particularly at the high school level. Recent literature of the unsuccessful high school (eg. Cusick, 1983; Powell et al. 1985) portrays an institution with students processed in an impersonal fashion through their educational career. Negative learning contracts and non-interference are the norm in such places. The positive literature on successful high schools (Lightfoot, 1983; Macrorie, 1984; Elmore, 1988) describe the closeness and intimacy between teacher and the learner. The informants give similar pictures of their school experience significantly more so at the high school level.

The informants describe the positive interaction between themselves and the high school model. The personal dialogue the informant felt existed extended beyond the boundaries of the classroom in

some instances. High school models directed the dialogue into areas not bounded by the express purpose of a particular class. The data refer to the ability of positive models to talk with the informant about personal subjects. The establishment of a shared culture based on humor or influenced by the models' excitement with the subject as a process of enquiry. Some informants gave evidence of the individual models' dedication beyond established norms in a secondary school. This dedication was a commentary on the amount of time evaluating student work or the care and invention presenting challenging or exciting material. Friendship, as Denscombe (1980) finds, is used by young teachers as a control strategy. The data suggest such a strategy powerfully reinforced by rememberance. It leads to the argument that rememberence is a reinforcer to a teaching behavior not its source.

Two important criteria about choosing models emerge from the analysis so far. First, the respondents remember process not content in relation to the model. In other words they remember how they were taught. Second, the informant reports a strong affective reaction to the model teacher cited. Pedagogy and the ability to personalize the experience at the high school level are essential conditions for the informant choice. Subject matter knowledge was an important but not a necessary condition to citing of positive models. Much the same picture emerged from the negative models at this level. A negative model could have subject matter knowledge but failed to communicate that knowledge or did so in a way

resented by the informant. The distant negative models seemed not to care whether students learnt or was capricious in their behavior. The capriciousness took the form of teachers who failed to understand the informant's difficulty with the material. One example is the teacher who handed work essential for tests back too late to aid revision. Failing to provide feedback was an isolating tactic adopted by some teachers to distance themselves from their pupils. This discussion opens a broad area of speculation regarding the role of subject matter in teacher preparation.

While most informants recognized the existing power and role relationships, the positive high school experience involved varying views of control and interaction. The informants report their impression that successful high school models allow the student to explore and sometimes direct the learning experience. The informants report such a dialogue with models they saw as innovative.

The strong sense in these descriptions is a contract with obligations on both sides. One informant talked of the innovative English teacher who encouraged the study of material beyond the normally expected. This led to a matching responsibility for the informant to strive toward high standards. This contracting was apparent in English. The informants saw recognition by the teacher of student interests in sophisticated or different material (beyond the regular curriculum). The former pupils saw this risk-taking

behavior as part of a learning contract. In contrast there was a lack of this sense of contract in Mathematics. Innovative techniques or relating to everyday applications were cited but teacher (model) directed. Former pupils did not see Mathematics as an area where their interests formed part of the learning contract. This distinction in contracting or not contracting within different content areas raises questions regarding subject matter and pedagogical behavior at the secondary level.

As a link to a short commentary on elementary models I present a listing of the criteria for positive and negative models. The data generated order came from the frequency of informant explanation.

| Elementary. | Secondary. |
|---|---|
| 1. Personal enjoyment of the learning experience. (related to subject matter) | 1. Feeling of closeness and perceived special attention. (directed dialogue) |
| 2. Feeling of closeness and perceived special attention. | 2. Liking\respect\admiration for the teacher providing the experience. |
| 3. Liking\respect\admiration for teacher who provided the experience. | 3. Personal enjoyment of the learning experience. |
| | 4. Subject matter structure becomes intrinsically important to informant. |

The above table shows a difference in the criteria most often cited at the two levels of schooling. The listing represents the priority in the role of student not that of a teacher. While the criteria remain unchanged there are differences in the ordering of the criteria. The quantitative analysis lead to a qualitative assessment of the process of choice that reveals an order on an individual basis. Informants describing secondary experience often used a progression listed above as a frequency count. For example, the informant cited a feeling of closeness with the model they were about to describe. An expression of liking the model quickly followed this bonding. Then the story turned to learning enjoyment and less often but still significantly to liking the subject knowledge.

> "There was one teacher that I had for Algebra in 9th grade, for Chemistry in 11th grade, Physics in 12th grade and Computer Science in 12th grade. I worked for him during the Summer, and I remember that sort of thing because you build a bond with a teacher to be a good influence..... I enjoyed most the classes where I got along well with the teacher." (Jessie, preservice high school teacher)

> "I made a really strong friendship with one of my teachers and as a matter of fact she was my math teacher. I had her in 11th and 12th grade, she was also the one I was a teacher aide for..... she was important to me and that made a difference in the way I looked at things going on in the class..... You

know she was the type of person all the students really liked her... She is a really good teacher [respondent details a pedagogical practice showing how this teacher got her to learn] It's really nice to have someone else besides Mom and Dad sitting there and coaching you on."

(Jill, prospective high school teacher)

"Freshman year in high school.... I didn't like Science so I didn't participate much in class.....She started asking me questions to make me think about it....she would come up with things that pertain to my life and make me look at things in a scientific way. I went into the high Science classes and just loved them from then on.

(Julia, prospective high school teacher)

These examples represent a large body of text that illustrates the choice process operating at the high school level. A claim of special bonding linked to feelings of liking then some commentary regarding the subject or learning process itself.

The placement of the closeness or intimacy part is a second priority for elementary and first for secondary. The order runs counter at both levels to intuitions expected if you asked teachers to produce the list. At the elementary level according to the self reports the subject matter and task are high in the order. Elementary teachers often orient themselves toward the development of social relations above subject matter. The conventional wisdom

about secondary teachers suggests subject matter knowledge transmission is a primary concern.

The confounding variable here is the personal intimacy reported. This signifies successful projection by the student onto the teacher. At the elementary level projection follows egocentric enjoyment by the student. A successful mirroring leads to feelings of liking the teacher. At the secondary level, linked to the students' own stage of development, projection occurs first. Then follows a judgement based on successful confirmation. This exchange in which the teacher played a minor but important role then leads to acceptence of the subject.

As would be expected the remembrance of primary teachers was less perfect for many. The lower number of negative models reflects a function of time decay and changed perceptions. More often than in comments on high school teachers, informants provided wide generalization (All my primary teachers were really great/nice/neat/fun).

The stepped criteria process so striking in individual secondary stories occurred with less frequency in the elementary models. There are examples that illustrate the different ordering process in some of the recollections. The following show a preoccupation with the learning experience leading to a special bond and liking for the teacher that provided the experience.

"I always really enjoyed math and I had a 3rd grade teacher that recognized I could do a little bit more and separated three of us out of the class and gave us an extra book to work on."

(Gillian, preservice high school teacher)

"I enjoyed my creative writing so even after I was out of their class I used to show them what I wrote.... I remember just being on a nice enjoyable personal level with all my teachers and I got a lot out of their classes."

(Jack, preservice elementary teacher)

Informants cite some similar characteristics of the positive and negative elementary models. The stories were less a dialogue between themselves and the model. Pedagogy still figured in many of the recollections of good practice but related to stronger overt control exercised by the model teacher. Intuitively, the power and authority relationships present in the elementary context lead to an expectancy that teacher controlled behavior is acceptable. This contrasts with "top-down talk-at" models present in a few cases of positive secondary models. In the secondary context they generated feelings of resentment or reluctant praise. No such inhibition existed in the elementary models.

Informants discussing the primary experience focused on the personal enjoyment they derived from learning. Phrases such as this topic was fun and specific field trips or other activities

were the focus of the talk. There was a general sense of the model teacher caring or nurturing the informant, rather than a focused concern for the informant alone. A couple of informants told of their personal satisfaction in being allowed to share control with the teacher. They reported the teacher saw them as leaders or interested in teaching and they served as classroom monitors when the need arose. "Playing at being teacher" formed an expectancy for the psychic reward in teaching.

There was lateral consistency in the informants' answers. If an informant stated they enjoyed communicating with students, then often they cited a similar trait in the model teacher described. The past model acts as an exemplar of the projected quality that becomes a desirable quality for their own practice. The model forms a justification for how one "knows" what good teaching involves. This gives a story with valid reasons showing an everyday truth statement.

In lateral consistency were several marked instances where an informant applied a consistent yardstick. A positive mathematics model was patient and described in sharp contrast with her engineer father. He, in counterpoint, was impatient and unable to communicate the ideas of math despite a perceived aptitude for the subject. A prospective elementary teacher cited a negative elementary model who embarrassed her in first grade. She recalled how in First Grade she was forced to beat her own hand in front of

the class. She refused to go to school for a week because of embarrassment. In an earlier section she stressed the importance to her of being in tune with the emotions of her students. Other research shows people used particularistic and partial selection in their descriptions of role models. Some even recognize a reflective process that attributes a changed attitude to the recollection. In a couple of cases this reconstruction produced less rather than clearer understanding of the incident.

The models represent reality as the mentee would like it to be. The support for this conclusion is the individualization the informants report so consistently. The chances of such a constant occurence repeated over many geographically different settings and a time span of over sixty years of educational history I find remote. Veracity is not the issue what appears striking is the latent ideal vision of teaching attributed to these positive and negative models. The recollections represent a degree of "knowing" at the everyday level not in the deep philosophical sense.

According to Zeichner and others many in teacher education ignore such knowledge claims on a regular basis. Mentors can stimulate the meta-cognitive activity in their protegee and allow them to make a shift toward a fuller sense of "knowing about teaching." Enriched knowledge of the practice of teaching requires a more sophisticated picture of the student--teacher relationship than provided by a memory of some "nice teacher" five or forty years in

the past. Teaching is an example of an activity with a poorly defined and controversial knowledge base. It confirms the skeptical conclusion that deep philosophical knowledge may be an impossible dream. Such a conclusion does not imply that reflection and struggle to a richer sense of teaching is useless.

Self-Portraits as Photographs.

This last section briefly describes the role of self-conceptions of teaching. As noted already the data here dealt with the why the informant wished to enter teaching. Informants often used either a personal satisfaction in some aspect of teaching or a liking or caring for children. On some occasions these answers were probed to get a full sense of what such statements meant. Many replies mirrored the findings reported by Lortie.

There is a small but significant number of teachers who saw themselves as change agents. This innovation tendency showed in a few minority informants, females who had parent experience, a program preparing small numbers[5] and the alternative route teachers. The self-portrait often centered on either personal bad experiences in education or experiences of people close to them.

---

[5] This change agent phenomenon is reported as an important element in the program of these students. A recently published interview with the head of the program confirms this finding. "How It's Done at Dartmouth." Colloquy. 2(1), Fall 1988. Michigan State University: NCRTE.

The alternative route and the selective institution yielded more general rationale based on "research and test results" as they saw them. These responses vocalized conventional wisdom regarding the generally low regard and standard of public school teachers.

In Figure 1 I note the tendency of less specific models chosen by experienced teachers and people entering teaching from other professions. This trend accompanied a rise in the depth of description about self as a teacher. This was especially noticeable in the alternative route induction program. They had reflected and can explain their reasons a major life change. Figure 1 also showed fewer models in the preservice Site 5 considering the number of interviews. While a significant proportion are not contemplating teaching the yield ratio of models to informants is less than other pre-service sites. Demographic and interview information suggested many respondents did not come directly to the program from high school. Like the alternative route, their decision represents a major change. The number and depth of self-portraits in this site is higher.

Conclusions.

A major conclusion I draw stems from the distinction between remembrance and constructs. The models in remembrance play a passive role as reflectors of projected qualities when the informant was a student. While they retain the Bandura type exemplar role I suggest their conscious modelling was coincidental

if not passive in the learner--teacher interaction. The remembrance then forms a teacher perspective (used in the formal sense not a mistaken cognition) of the informant.

This is the link between the story and a construct of teaching. The tale serves the function of a mythology. Like all good myths there is some truth contained within the story. The teacher model serves as potential criteria on which to validate the informant's idea of teaching. Lateral consistency and application of consistent yardsticks are strong evidence of the subtle link between remembrance (in model story form) and a construct of teaching. Such is the function of remembrance to the construct of teaching.

On the positive side (assuming a "Reflective Practitioner Model") these stories could serve as a powerful educative tool to help the novice toward better practice. Remembrance and its associated affect could tell the novice where they are going wrong in their own practice of the craft. For example, a teacher educator or generic mentor may point out to a secondary teacher that this particular pedagogical practice distances them from the learners. The presence of a third party in this reflection comes from the lesson of the pitfalls in assuming experience alone produces learning. As Lortie states we all go through the "apprenticeship of observation." The data reported confirms the high affective

value Lortie speaks to in the confines of the classroom. Remembrance is also important in what it lacks.

This leads to the negative (assuming a "Professional Standards Model") side of remembrance. Lortie, Feiman-Nemser, Buchmann and others point to the remembrance's lack of attention to specifics or explicit forms of assessment suitable for the professional teacher. The required presence of the third party provides the stimulus for fine-grained reflection and evaluation. I suggest remembrance has a greater potential for inhibiting the novice's teaching. The picture of a novice, without a skilled guide, getting out their old photo album seems a dangerous learning strategy. It is dangerous because some of my informants' show a disposition toward replicating their own pleasantly remembered school experience. A Kantian moralist would object strongly to students becoming the means to some private replication experiment.

It is also dangerous from the very nature of the knowing it represents. There is evidence of obsession with process (biased by the context of student perspective). This paper argued remembrance of the "model in a context" could represent an illusion. An illusion created from the projection by the informant into a remembered interaction. Basing a craft upon a potential illusion or post hoc re-evaluation does not satisfy my ideal of adequate professional training. Some may object to the strength of the word illusion. I cite Descarte's skeptical conclusion about

knowledge and Hume's questioning that we temper our confidence in past experience. Hume argues cogently to the danger of assuming the uniformity of nature stretching into our future.

I caste doubt upon remembrance of models representing true knowing. If one sees these stories as linked but not a foundational part of the novice's world view then it puts the story in perspective. I emphasized, with empirical evidence, the power of these models and their potential to do good or evil. There is no hidden truth or secret about teaching captured by a photograph. They are lifeless pieces of paper that take on meaning when somebody examines them and starts to interpret a meaning. The emotion for active participants associated with the photographs should not be ignored. My Great-Grandmother (mentor) was an interactive interpreter. I had the chance to question inconsistencies. The listener and teller construct the story in an open forum. These novices and practitioners carry round their own photos. People rarely go beyond a superficial enquiry about another's collection. Viewing the photographs becomes a private activity. The image of something possibly distasteful is deliberate on my part. Without frank and skilled dialogue with someone else who knows what distortions may lie in the owners interpretation. What constructs of teaching are justified by these stories? To talk of a community of professionals and allow such a powerful private learning experience pass unexamined appears contradictory.

References.

Adler, S. (1984). A field study of selected student teacher perspectives toward social studies. Theory and Research in Social Education, 12, 13-30.

Bandura, A. (1977). Social Learning Theory. Englewood Cliffs, CA: Prentice Hall.

Buchmann, M. (1985). What is irrational about knowledge utilization. Curriculum Inquiry, 15, 153-168

Buchmann, M. (1987a). Role over person: Justifying teacher action and decisions. Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research, 31(1), 1-21.

Buchmann, M. (1987b). Impractical philosophizing about teachers' arguments. Educational Theory, 37(4), 409-411.

Clark, C.M., & Peterson, P.L. (1986). Teachers' thought processes. In M.C. Wittrock (Ed.). Handbook of research on teaching (pp. 265-296). New York: MacMillan.

Cusick, P.A. (1983). The egalitarian ideal and the American high school. New York: Longman.

Denscombe, M. (1980). Pupil strategies and the open classroom. In P. Woods (Ed.). Pupil strategies: Explorations in the sociology of school London: Croom Helm.

Dinham, S.M., & Stritter, F.T. (1986). Research on professional education. In M.C. Wittrock (Ed.). Handbook of research on teaching (pp.952-970). New York: MacMillan.

Dundes, A. (1972). Folk ideas as units of worldview. In A. Paredes & R. Bauman (Eds.). Toward new perspectives in folklore. Austin: University of Texas, American Folklore Society.

Elmore, R. (1988). [Community District 4, New York City]. Unpublished case study.

Feiman-Nemser, S. & Buchmann, M. (1986). Pitfalls of experience in teacher education. In J.D. Raths & L.G. Katz (Eds.). Advances in teacher education, volume 2 (pp.61-72). Norwood, NJ: Ablex.

Feiman-Nemser, S. & Floden, R.E. (1986). The cultures of teaching. In M.C. Wittrock (Ed.). Handbook of research on teaching (pp. 505-526). New York: MacMillan.

Fisher, R., & Ury, W. (1981). Getting to yes. New York: Penguin Books.

Glaser, R. (1984). Education and thinking: The role of knowledge. American Psychologist, 39, 93-104.

Hardcastle, B. (1988). Spiritual connections: Proteges' reflections on significant mentorships. Theory into Practice, 27, 201-208.

Kennedy, M.M. (1989). Reflection and the problem of professional standards. NCRTE Colloquy, 2, 1-6.

Lightfoot, S.L. (1983). The good high school. New York: Basic Books.

Little, J.W. (1981). School success and staff development: The role of staff development in urban desegregated schools. (NIE No.

400-79-0049). Boulder: University of Colorado, Center for Action Research.

Lortie, D. (1975). Schoolteacher: A sociological study. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Macrorie, K. (1984). 20 teachers. New York: Oxford University Press.

Mead, J.V. (1988, April). Does a professional code of ethics exist for teachers? Paper presented at American Educational Research Association, New Orleans.

Mischel, W. (1979). On the interface of cognition and personality: Beyond the person-situation debate. American Psychologist, 34a, 740-754.

Powell, A.G., Farrar, E., & Cohen, D.K. (1985). The shopping mall high school. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Ross, E.W. (1988). Becoming a teacher: The development of preservice teacher perspectives. Action in Teacher Education, 10,(2),101-109.

Schein, E.H. (1985). Organizational culture and leadership. San Francisco: Jossey Bass.

Schon, D. (1983). The reflective practitioner. New York: Basic Books.

Sikes, P.J. (1985). The life cycle of a teacher. In S.J.Ball and I.F.Goodson (Eds.). Teachers' lives and careers (pp. 27-60). London: Falmer Press.

Yamamoto, K. (1988). To see life grow: The meaning of mentorship. Theory into Practice, 27, 183-189.

Zeichner, K.M., Tabernick, B.R., & Densmore, K. (1987). Individual, institutional, and cultural influences on the development of teachers' craft knowledge. In J. Calderhead (Ed.). Exploring teachers' thinking (pp.21-59). New York: Cassell.

Zimpher, N.L. & Reiger, S.R. (Eds.). (1988). Mentoring teachers: What are the issues? [Special issue]. Theory into Practice, 27.

Figure 1.

| | | | PRESERVICE | | | | | | | | | | | | | | INDUCTION | | | | INSERVICE | | TOT. MODEL TYPE |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | 1 | | 2 | | | 3 | | | 4 | 5 | | | 6 | 7 | | | 8 | 9 | |
| | | | HSM | EL | HSM | HSW | EL | HSM | EL | MM | EL | HSW | EL | PSY | EL | HSM | HSW | HS Sc. | EL | EL | |
| HIGH SCHOOL MODELS | Bad | M | 0 | 3 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 13 |
| | | W | 0 | 3 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 9 |
| | | Oth. | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 5 |
| | Good | M | 9 | 6 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 8 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 34 |
| | | W | 5 | 3 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 4 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 28 |
| | | Oth. | 3 | 2 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 13 |
| ELEM. MODELS | Bad | | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 11 |
| | Good | | 2* | 14 | 2 | 1 | 5 | 1* | 2 | 0 | 6 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 10 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 50 |
| | Total/Models Age Range | | 19 | 32 | 2 | 14 | 7 | 16 | 7 | 14 | 13 | 7 | 3 | 3 | 13 | 0 | 9 | 0 | 3 | 1 | |
| | Total/Site | | 51 | | 23 | | | 37 | | | 13 | 13 | | | 13 | 9 | | | 3 | 1 | 163 |
| | Interviews Analyzed | | 15 | | 11 | | | 15 | | | 10 | 21 | | | 10 | 13 | | | 6 | 8 | 109 |

* Specifically talk about math in elementary teacher model.

KEY

HSW High School Writing

HSM High School Math

Oth Other

EL Elementary

MM Math Major

PSY Psychology Major

125 positive models

38 negative models





BEST COPY AVAILABLE